

**Kentucky Board of Education - Regular Meeting
February 7, 2018**

**300 Sower Boulevard, 5th Floor (514)
Frankfort, KY 40601**

SUMMARY MINUTES

The Kentucky Board of Education held its regular meeting on February 7, 2018, in the State Board Room (514) on the Fifth Floor of the 300 Building at 300 Sower Blvd., Frankfort, Kentucky. The board conducted the following business:

I. Call to Order

Chair Mary Gwen Wheeler called the meeting to order at 9:06 a.m. ET.

II. Roll Call of Members and Advisors

Chair Wheeler asked Rebecca Blessing (substituting for Leslie Slaughter, who was ill) to call the roll of members and advisors. With nine (9) voting members present and two (2) absent, there was a quorum. CPE President Bob King (ex-officio member) and three board advisors also were present.

Present Board Members:

Mr. Ben Cundiff
Mr. Richard Gimmel
Mr. Samuel Hinkle
Mr. Gary Houchens
Ms. Alesa Johnson
Ms. Nawanna Privett
Mr. Milton Seymore
Mr. William Twyman
Ms. Mary Gwen Wheeler

Present Advisors:

Ms. Kathy Gornik
Mr. Wayne Lewis
Mr. Joe Papalia

Absent Board Members:

Mr. Grayson Boyd
Mr. Roger Marcum

Absent Advisors:

Ms. Tracey Cusick

Following the roll call, Chair Wheeler asked for a moment of silence for the victims, families and school staff in Marshall County that were affected by the recent school shooting at Marshall County High School.

III. Approval of the Consent Agenda

Chair Wheeler asked board members if there were any items from the consent agenda they wished to have removed in order to discuss separately. Items on the consent agenda for this meeting included the following:

III.A. Action Items

- III.A.1. New District Facility Plan: Burgin Independent School District*
- III.A.2. District Facility Plan Amendments: Hardin County and Montgomery County School Districts*
- III.A.3. Minutes from December 5, 2017, Work Session and December 6, 2017, Regular Meeting*

III.B. Information Items

- III.B.1. Kentucky Department of Education (KDE) Combined Employment Report*
- III.B.2. Hearing Officers Report (Status Report of KBE Administrative Regulations)*
- III.B.3. Litigation Report*

Board member Bill Twyman asked for discussion of the Career and Technical Education (CTE) employment report, which is an information item. Wheeler agreed this item would be discussed following a vote on the remainder of the consent agenda.

Subsequently, members Ben Cundiff moved and Sam Hinkle seconded a motion to approve the consent agenda. The motion passed with a unanimous voice vote.

In taking up the CTE employment report, Twyman said he was concerned that the numbers of minorities reflected on the report had remained constant and he inquired what the department was doing to increase minority employment. Commissioner of Education Stephen Pruitt responded that the department had implemented new recruiting strategies to increase the number of minority employees, specifically in the Career and Technical Education fields. Pruitt stated that the root of the problem is two-fold:

- 1) the existing workforce does not have many minorities; and
- 2) the pipeline of employees, specifically those entering the teaching field from industry, does not include many minority candidates.

Vice Chair Rich Gimmel added that minority enrollment in CTE programs is also very low. Pruitt said the department had started working with the Kentucky Community and Technical College System (KCTCS) and was attending job fairs to increase minority employment.

IV. Report from the Secretary of the Education and Workforce Development Cabinet

Education and Workforce Development Cabinet Secretary Hal Heiner began his report by calling the board's attention to House Bill 247 (2018) filed by Rep. James Tipton that is under review by the Kentucky General Assembly. Heiner explained that the bill would combine the Kentucky Educational Excellence Scholarship (KEES) and Dual Credit Scholarship into one program with some modifications. He stated that all students would qualify to earn a base scholarship award by progressing from one grade to the next; however, the amount of the award earned based on GPA would increase by 12%.

Heiner said that students would be able to access up to 18% of KEES money beginning their sophomore year in high school to pay for dual credit courses or Advanced Placement (AP), International Baccalaureate (IB) or Cambridge examination fees. He explained that participating postsecondary institutions would continue to limit the cost of dual credit coursework to one-third of the KCTCS in-state per credit hour tuition cost, making it more economical to start college coursework while still in high school.

Heiner said that under the measure, any student who qualifies for a Pell, College Access Program (CAP) or Kentucky Tuition Grant (KTG) need-based grant must utilize these grant funds before KEES awards are made available. He noted that any KEES awards not used by the student would remain in their account and be available to them in subsequent semesters. Heiner said because the Dual Credit Scholarship Program and KEES would be combined, the changes would end up being revenue neutral. He said the proposal also includes a “built-in escalator,” so that the merit awards would keep pace with inflation starting in the year 2020.

The full report from Heiner can be found on the KBE online materials site.

V. Report from the President of the Council on Postsecondary Education (CPE)

Council on Postsecondary Education President Bob King began his remarks by asking CPE employee Sue Cain to stand. King explained that Cain has been the main liaison with KDE in recent years and that she recently announced her retirement. The board gave Cain a standing ovation for her service. King then introduced Dr. Dawn Offutt as Cain's replacement. He noted that Offutt had previously been working with the Gear-Up Program within CPE.

In continuing with his report, King indicated that CPE has provided Adult Education locations in all 120 Kentucky counties. However, due to a change in the contracting with providers, multiple counties now will be required to collaborate with other nearby counties. King noted that these changes were in response to budgetary, management and enrollment concerns in particular regions across the state. He stated that this will allow for sustained service where enrollments may have declined and will allow more staff expertise to meet the region's needs. King said that not all providers will be able to participate, as they have in the past.

King also told the board about Accelerated Opportunities, a program that lets Adult Education students earn a certificate with KCTCS while earning a GED. King said that with Kentucky's Medicaid waiver, more recipients will be compelled to get training to get into the workforce and it is anticipated they will see Adult Education as their gateway back into formal education and employment.

King reported that the annual CPE Student Success Summit is scheduled for April 9-10, 2018. He said national experts will be speaking about the future of undergraduate education. Furthermore, he told the board that various CPE workgroups have met to discuss how to assess quality in undergraduate programs and the council has been involved in some national efforts in this area.

King thanked Commissioner Pruitt for allowing CPE to participate in developing the request for proposal (RFP) for a new college entrance exam, which will be released soon.

Additionally, King reported that at its recent meeting, the council endorsed a new set of diversity plans for each state college campus. He indicated that the plans set forth enrollment and employment targets and address campus environments. King explained that the diversity plans also require the colleges to establish plans for closing persistent achievement gaps that exist. In instances where gaps are getting wider, King said that he has asked the campuses to revise plans and implement strategies that are proven to close gaps and create more equitable outcomes for students.

Board advisor Wayne Lewis agreed with King that Adult Education will be an important gateway tied to Medicaid reform. He asked King how the council had addressed additional skills training. King answered that the accelerated opportunities were one mechanism for doing this. Also, he noted that Adult Education had created a program known as “Skills U” in coordination with KCTCS, which is tying outcomes to students getting the skill training they need to find employment and have real value in the marketplace.

Board member Bill Twyman asked about the financial resources that are available to Adult Education learners. In addition to obtaining a GED, King said that working-age adults who do not have an associate degree can enroll on a college campus to obtain one, free of charge, in one of the state’s five high-demand industry sectors thanks to the Work Ready Scholarship created by Gov. Matt Bevin. King noted other need-based programs and financial aid that can assist with advanced degrees should the adult student wish to continue his or her education beyond an associate degree.

The full report from King can be found on the KBE online materials site.

VI. Report from the Executive Director of the Education Professional Standards Board (EPSB)

Education Professional Standards Board Executive Director Jimmy Adams began by informing the KBE that the Kentucky Teacher Internship Program (KTIP) was one of the 70 programs cut in the governor's budget proposal that the General Assembly is currently considering. He said KTIP has been a nationally noted program and has been important to keeping teacher attrition rates down (30% nationally vs. 10% in Kentucky). He also noted that the program is well supported by teachers, as evidenced through the TELL Survey. Adams said KTIP is a vital program and its elimination would be detrimental to education in the state.

Board member Nawanna Privett agreed and asked if the EPSB had worked to educate legislators about the benefits of KTIP and how important it was for teachers and students. Adams said these efforts were ongoing. Commissioner Pruitt also voiced his support of the program. Bill Twyman expressed his belief that KTIP is the equivalent of an apprenticeship for educators and that it should be continued.

Adams explained that the EPSB board is scheduled to adopt Professional Standards for Educational Leaders (PSEL) at its upcoming meeting on Feb. 12. He said that the PSEL standards were developed and adopted in 2015 by the National Policy Board for Educational Administrators. Adams stated that the purpose of the adoption of the PSEL standards is for all advanced educational

leadership preparation providers in Kentucky to align their programs and have candidates demonstrate the competencies associated within the 10 standards.

Adams said that the PSEL standards articulate the knowledge and skills expected of school leaders. He explained that these standards have a systemic view of leadership that cross all domains and elements of leadership work, all roles of administrative leaders, all contexts (school and community), and all levels of the educational system (school and district level).

Adams also noted several administrative regulations that will be coming before the EPSB in the coming months. Those regulations were:

- *16 KAR 2:010, Kentucky professional and provisional teacher certificates;*
- *16 KAR 5:030, Proficiency Evaluation; and*
- *16 KAR 5:040, Admission, placement, and supervision in student teaching.*

Adams stated that the EPSB has received comments concerning 16 KAR 2:010 and 16 KAR 5:030. Based on those comments, he said staff will recommend to the EPSB board to keep the “highly qualified” route for certification in place and to allow the proficiency evaluation to include a route for initial certification. Adams said that if there is a mass exodus from the teaching profession, this will allow them to maintain high quality.

Adams reported that in coming months the EPSB will be revisiting the current educator rank system and also developing a competency-based system for teachers.

The full report from Adams can be found on the KBE online materials site.

VII. Report from the Commissioner of Education

Commissioner of Education Stephen Pruitt began by welcoming new KDE employees. Those recognized were:

Office of Continuous Improvement and Support

- Toni A. Harrod, Administrative Specialist III
Division of Consolidated Plans & Audits/Planning Branch

Office of Finance and Operations

- Sarah Astor, Dietetics Educator
Division of School & Community Nutrition/Programmatic Delivery Section

Also, Commissioner Pruitt recognized the KDE “Team Member of the Month” for January 2018, which was Amy Peabody. Peabody is the deputy general counsel within the KDE Office of Legal, Legislative and Communication Services. The board thanked Peabody with a round of applause.

Following the recognition, Commissioner Pruitt diverted from his written report to begin outlining five key initiatives that comprise his new strategic plan for moving Kentucky education forward. He explained the five initiatives in detail, which included the following:

1. **K-3 Literacy:** Commissioner Pruitt stated that this was a renewed effort, but not as the state has done in the past by forcing students to read more. He expressed his desire for educators to find things that students like and to build on that with a comprehensive literacy program that engages a child's interest. Commissioner Pruitt acknowledged that there must be an intentional focus at the department on K-3 Literacy. He said that the KDE will renew the concept of the ungraded primary and leverage the new Striving Readers Literacy Grant, among other things, to move the work forward. He said that KDE also will partner with the education co-ops across the state. Commissioner Pruitt noted that KDE has developed those relationships by working with them on developing an instructional resources bank and KDE will continue to build on the partnership established through that work. The commissioner noted that challenges to this work include funding, culture and teacher training.
2. **Individual Instruction and Assessment:** Commissioner Pruitt stressed that the state must rethink learning and assessment and get away from the concept of “same for everyone.” He stressed that we must adopt a more “move on when ready” approach for students. He stated his belief that everything we do in K-12 education leads to a career and that the state can do more to prepare every child to pursue a successful career. Commissioner Pruitt provided some ideas surrounding the movement to more online assessments and changing the state’s Individualized Learning Plan (ILP) to be more meaningful for students and teachers.
3. **Diploma Requirements:** The commissioner said that it was time to change how we think about the high school diploma. He said that we should have graduation requirements that allow student to learn in areas they enjoy. “It's time we flipped the script on the future,” he said. Commissioner Pruitt stated that Kentucky must make stronger connections of what students are learning with more application of the learning. He went on to say that high school graduation in Kentucky should be the same as college and career readiness. He expressed his belief that, if done right, new graduation requirements will result in lower graduation rates for several years following initial implementation. Commissioner Pruitt stressed the importance of ensuring that the state doesn't resort to tracking students and creating inequities through the new process. He also discussed potential ideas surrounding modular assessment models.
4. **Student Success at Postsecondary:** Commissioner Pruitt explained that the state must give students more opportunities to experience postsecondary success while still in high school. Examples include Advanced Place (AP) coursework, International Baccalaureate (IB) coursework, dual credit coursework and industry certifications.
5. **Social and Emotional Help for Students:** The commissioner stressed that the K-12 system must have a strong focus on social and emotional well-being of our students. He discussed the concern that our teachers are not well-equipped to help our students with these issues. He explained that this is a new area of emphasis for KDE and the need to raise an awareness of its importance to our students and the success of our schools.

Pruitt explained that the first letter of each of the focal points spells the acronym “KIDSS” and he said that’s what this work should be about. Commissioner Pruitt expressed his belief that if the state can do each of these things well, Kentucky is likely to:

- *lead the nation in closing the achievement gap in 4th-grade reading in about four years;*
- *lead the nation in increasing the percentage of industry certifications that our students earn;*
- *move from 14th to fifth in the nation in ACT average scores by 2030; and*
- *increase the state’s gross domestic product by billions of dollars.*

Chair Wheeler thanked the commissioner for his vision. Ben Cundiff stated his belief that the state and country needs to elevate education, as in Singapore and other countries, by ensuring strong preparation for teachers, so that they are revered and respected in their communities.

CPE President Bob King congratulated the commissioner on his vision, saying that these ideals are critical to Kentucky and its children. King said the state also needs to attract high-performing students into the field of education. King cited data from PISA international exams administered in 75 nations, in which they test 15-year-olds in three to four subject areas. He said that students in Singapore test higher by three to four academic years beyond their peer students in the United States.

King said the reality is that we are graduating students in our country that are no longer competitive in our world. He said that too often students with a high school diploma are still in need of remediation when they enter postsecondary coursework. King stated his support for moving in the direction that the commissioner outlined. He also noted that higher education is now seeing the need for high-quality guidance counselors who can provide assistance to students when making future career decisions.

Bill Twyman congratulated Commissioner Pruitt for setting forth aspirational and realistic goals. He said the short-term goal needs to focus on keeping teachers in the classroom. Cundiff said a crisis is a terrible thing to waste. He stated that if there is a mass exodus, the state needs to take advantage of the turnover to recruit and retain teachers with expertise in the classroom and to elevate the standards of the profession.

Commissioner Pruitt said that with PISA, there is a national pride in many countries that we do not always witness in the United States. For example, he noted that when Germany scored low, they saw it as a national crisis. Over the next decade they began to change and are among the best countries out there. Pruitt said we need to help people realize the status quo is no longer good enough. He says this has to be created across the board through a shift in culture. He stated that this is probably one of the biggest tasks at hand, regardless of where individuals live or their income.

The full report given by Commissioner Pruitt can be found on the KBE online materials site.

VIII. Kentucky Department of Education (KDE) Strategic Plan (Review Item: 20 minutes) - Karen Dodd, KDE Chief Performance Officer

KDE Chief Performance Officer Karen Dodd provided an update to the board regarding the department's strategic planning efforts. She explained that all offices have submitted drafts of their operational plans to the commissioner for his review. Dodd explained that the operational plans are to be living documents and are subject to change. KDE consultant Melody Cooper shared an example of a potential dashboard model that may be used to reflect progress on the goals and objectives of the KDE strategic plan. Cooper said the board could expect baseline data to be reported for the first time in October or December 2018.

Commissioner Pruitt told the board that this process will be transparent and progress on the strategic plan will be posted online. He said the plan's indicators will be assessed across all offices, not just those offices that support teaching and learning directly. He stated this will be an agency-wide tool that can be used to measure internal success. Dodd said KDE will be looking more at qualitative, rather than quantitative, data throughout the process.

Chair Wheeler inquired as to how the board will be kept up-to-date on the strategic plan and its progress. Dodd responded that she and her team are working with KBE Executive Director Leslie Slaughter to identify appropriate topics and data that can be shared with the board at each regular meeting.

IX. Competency-Based Education and Assessment Pilot Update (Review Item: 20 minutes) - David Cook, KDE Director of Innovation and Partner Engagement

David Cook, KDE Director of Innovation and Partner Engagement, presented an update on the state's new Competency Education and Assessment (CEA) pilot project. Using a PowerPoint presentation that can be found on the board's online materials site, Cook began by explaining that the pilot project was born from an assessment and accountability work group created by Commissioner Pruitt known as the Educational Innovations work group. Cook said the group was tasked with investigating and recommending strategies that can result in more individualized learning and assessment that may lead to closing gaps.

Cook said the pilot will have up to three cohorts of districts over a seven-year timeline. He said the Request for Application (RFA) process for the first cohort of districts concluded at the end of January. Cook said there was a low number of applicants for the first round, noting the complexity of the work associated with the pilot. He said six districts applied for the first cohort, with two qualifying districts being selected: Shelby and Trigg counties.

Cook explained that the participating districts will be looking at various ways to evaluate whether a student knows the content and standards beyond traditional forms of assessment. He said each district also will develop local competencies. If the districts have proven that they are adequately preparing students through the more innovative approaches, Cook said the districts would be eligible to gain more autonomy and have greater flexibility with their assessment measures.

For context, Cook shared an example of potential “anchor competencies” that would be developed by the pilot districts and utilized to create a graduate profile, reflecting what a student knows and is able to do. Example provided by Cook included concepts such as content application, critical thinking, global citizenship, effective communication and creativity and innovation.

Board member Sam Hinkle said the Shelby County Superintendent James Neihof has been committed to competency-based education for several years and that he does a great job for the students of Shelby County, where Hinkle is a former local board of education member.

Rich Gimmel asked why so few districts applied. Cook responded that the work associated with building a competency-based education and assessment system is a very heavy lift for districts, particularly while also maintaining traditional testing measures. Gimmel stated his belief that there is a lack of will and often great comfort in the “status quo.”

Gary Houchens applauded the districts that were willing to take on this important and innovative work.

Board advisor Kathy Gornik said this pilot would help define what the high school diploma means for Kentucky students in the future and she asked how this may differ from current requirements. Cook answered that a district may demonstrate mastery through project-based learning, as well as internships and other types of experiential learning, in a variety of ways outside the traditional tests that are given. Cook cited an example in Shelby County, where a local employer expressed concern that students weren't equipped with the skills needed and there wasn't a single career pathway being offered that aligned to his workforce demands locally. Cook said this forced the superintendent to investigate new ways to meet the employer's needs in the community and region, while better preparing students for success.

Commissioner Pruitt expressed concern that the state doesn't prepare its teachers to know how to assess students more deeply and that it is often times easier to buy off-the-shelf tests and curriculums. Pruitt says these two districts in the pilot already have shown a disposition and commitment to working in new ways that allow students to work with the same amount of rigor or more. He said the districts are developing their own assessments and correlating those outcomes with state tests to prove they are as strong or stronger.

Ben Cundiff asked if the state had considered Coco, a competency collector application that a teacher can use to record evidence of student mastery. He indicated that it displays student progress toward competency mastery in an electronic dashboard for each student. Cook said the app is in its first year of implementation within Eminence Independent Schools and that resources such as Coco are being investigated to support the pilot.

Chair Wheeler said that this work truly changes what a high school transcript looks like for a student and she asked CPE President Bob King to speak to the challenges faced for postsecondary education. King said his visit to Trigg County earlier in the year had shown this to be a very successful approach that engages kids in their own learning. King noted that the challenge is to prepare teachers to work in this type of environment. King asked if KDE was working with the districts that were not successful in their application for the first cohort. Cook responded that each

applicant had received feedback on their applications to determine where deficiencies may be present and that there would be arrangements made for other interested districts to spend some time in the pilot districts to learn about best practices and local implementation efforts.

X. Legislative Update on the 2018 Regular Session of the Kentucky General Assembly (Review Item: 30 minutes) - Kevin Brown, KDE Associate Commissioner/General Counsel and Tracy Goff Herman, KDE Policy Advisor

KDE Associate Commissioner and General Counsel Kevin Brown and Policy Advisor Tracy Goff Herman began by informing the board this was the 25th day of the 60-day legislative session. Brown explained that the legislature has only scheduled 59 days, with one reserved additional day. Brown reminded board members of the legislative update document provided to them in the online portal.

Herman said there are two big issues that are consuming legislative discussions, which are the pension bill and the development of the biennial budget. She indicated that KDE staff presented on the governor's proposed budget and its implications last week before the Budget Review Subcommittee. She said the Education and Workforce Development Cabinet was presenting today, as well.

Herman indicated the third big issue before the General Assembly is tax reform and revenue generation; however, she stated there does not seem to be much support for having those discussions until the pension and budget issues are resolved. Herman explained that KDE Associate Commissioner Robin Kinney presented to the House Education committee on House Bill (HB) 141, which would provide an allocation for an emergency loan fund to be utilized by eligible districts that are in financial distress.

Herman provided an overview of the additional education bills that the department was tracking and where those bills were in the legislative approval process. The board had significant discussion on the topic of future funding mechanisms for the state's charter schools. Herman explained that the current legislative language, which amended the 2016-18 biennial budget via HB 471 in 2017, is set to expire at the end of the current fiscal year.

Herman said that more than 40 educators have filed to run for public office.

No questions were noted by board members regarding the legislative update.

XI. 2018-2020 Executive Budget Recommendation Regarding P-12 Education (Review Item: 30 minutes) - Robin Kinney, KDE Associate Commissioner, and Charlie Harman, KDE Budget Director

Associate Commissioner Robin Kinney updated the board on the current fiscal year budget reductions for the P-12 education and a comparison of the governor's proposed budget as it relates to the agency's requests for the 2018-20 biennial budget.

Using a PowerPoint found on the board's online materials site, KDE Budget Director Charlie Harman explained that the state's current fiscal year deficit originally was anticipated at \$200 million, but was revised to \$155 million in December 2017. Harman explained that the governor made reductions to KDE's current fiscal year budget, via executive order, on December 28 that cut \$20.5 million in current year funding. Harman explained the areas of the budget that were impacted by these reductions. He said KDE had cut about 30 positions, which have an indirect impact on services to school districts. Harman explained that other cuts, ones with direct impact on districts, included areas such as professional development, textbooks, and Family Resource Youth Service Centers (FRYSCs).

Chair Wheeler asked about the impact of these mid-year cuts in terms of local district personnel. Harman said the potential cuts were communicated to districts and other partners as soon as they were known to be a possibility back in the fall months. Kinney stated that in some cases there may be a renegotiation of services provided or change within the scope of contracted work. Bill Twyman asked if there were any contractual issues that had surfaced thus far. Harman said no issues had surfaced yet and several contracts already had been amended. Ben Cundiff stated these cuts were evidence of the real cost associated with neglecting the pension crisis for so many years, and those decisions have real consequences.

Harman then outlined HB 200, the executive budget proposal presented by the governor. He focused on outlining the differences between the revised current fiscal year spending, the KBE requested budget and what the governor proposed. Harman noted that the governor proposed the elimination of funding for a total of 70 programs, 19 of which are in the K-12 education budget.

Harman indicated a budget should be out of the House sometime around the first week in March and it will then go to the Senate. He said that then the process will repeat itself. Harman said the commissioner will continue updating the board and that he is hopeful a budget may be through the entire process by the next KBE meeting in April. Harman said an extensive and official update will be given at the April meeting.

Twyman stated that since the shift in responsibility seems to be more toward local effort, he asked what districts were planning to do to handle these expenses. Kinney explained that districts are looking at all expenses and they are particularly concerned about shifts in transportation and health insurance costs. She said the cumulative effect of the cuts is what seems to be the most alarming to districts. Kinney stated that HB200 also speaks to several policy requirements, as well. She said the bill calls for a reduction in administrative costs over next two years for all districts. Kinney expressed her belief that everyone shares in the goal for all school districts to be as efficient as possible and that many districts are already demonstrating such efficiency. She acknowledged that, given the tough fiscal environment that already exists, these new policy requirements could prove to be very difficult for many districts. Nawanna Privett referenced a recent study she had seen of Kentucky's district personnel costs and the majority of districts already budgeted less than 10% for their administrative costs.

Kathy Gornik indicated that she is troubled by the lack of financial data that is available and digestible to the board. She stated she isn't certain whether districts are being efficient or not, due

to the lack of clarity surrounding the financial data being reported. She said the board is lacking useful data that can help it understand where the dollars are being spent.

XII. LUNCH - 12:00 p.m. ET (Provided for KBE members and advisors, invited guests and the Commissioner's Planning Committee members only)

At noon, Chair Mary Gwen Wheeler announced that the board would recess for lunch and that the meeting would resume at 1 p.m.

XIII. Public Comment Segment - 1:00 p.m. ET

There were no constituents who signed up to speak to the board during the public comment segment.

XIV. 703 KAR 5:191, Repeal of 703 KAR 5:190, Assistance to low-achieving schools and Repeal of 703 KAR 5:260, Intervention in priority schools (Second Reading, Action/Discussion Item) - Kelly Foster, KDE Associate Commissioner

KDE Associate Commissioner Kelly Foster presented this item for a second reading. No questions were noted by the board.

Chair Wheeler called for a motion for approval. Rich Gimmel moved to approve 703 KAR 5:191 as presented and Ben Cundiff seconded the motion. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

XV. 703 KAR 5:280, School improvement procedures (Second Reading, Action/Discussion Item) - Kelly Foster, KDE Associate Commissioner

KDE Associate Commissioner Kelly Foster reminded the board that this new regulation was being created to outline the new processes prescribed within SB1 (2017) and the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA). Referencing the draft regulation found on the board's online materials site, Foster highlighted the changes that have occurred to the regulation since the first reading and provided justification for each.

Chair Wheeler called for a motion for approval. Milton Seymore moved to approve the regulation and Sam Hinkle seconded the motion. The regulation was approved by unanimous voice vote.

XVI. 703 KAR 5:225, Continuous improvement process for schools and districts (Second Reading, Action/Discussion Item) - Kelly Foster, KDE Associate Commissioner

KDE Associate Commissioner Kelly Foster indicated there were no major changes since the first reading. She reminded the board that language surrounding the former assessment and accountability system was being removed from this regulation, since this information is no longer relevant and the new accountability system is now being guided by 703 KAR 5:270.

Chair Wheeler called for a motion for approval. Nawanna Privett moved to approve the amendments to 703 KAR 5:225 and the motion was seconded by Sam Hinkle. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

XVII. Committee Meetings (occurring simultaneously, in different locations)

XVII.A. Curriculum, Instruction and Assessment Committee Meeting - Conference Room 516

Committee Chair Gary Houchens called the meeting to order at approximately 1:20 p.m. Members present were Alesa Johnson, Nawanna Privett and Sam Hinkle. Roger Marcum was absent. Advisors Wayne Lewis and Kathy Gornik also joined the committee meeting.

XVII.A.1. Action/Discussion Item

XVII.A.1.a. Request for an Alternative Model of School-Based Decision Making (SBDM) from Adair County High School, Adair County Schools - Kelly Foster, KDE Associate Commissioner

KDE Associate Commissioner Kelly Foster presented this item. She said Adair County High School is seeking this waiver to include one non-voting student member on its local SBDM council. Nawanna Privett commended the school for taking advantage of this waiver opportunity and said she hoped others would pursue it in the future. No questions were posed by the committee members.

Committee Chair Houchens called for a motion to approve the waiver request. A motion for approval was made by Alesa Johnson and seconded by Sam Hinkle. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

XVII.A.2. Review Item

XVII.A.2.a. 704 KAR 3:015, Kentucky All STARS for Preschool Programs (First Reading) - Amanda Ellis, KDE Associate Commissioner

KDE Associate Commissioner Amanda Ellis and KDE preschool program staff Bill Buchanan and Sally Shepherd presented the first reading of this regulation. Using a PowerPoint found on the board's online materials site, Buchanan provided an overview of the regulation and its purpose, which is to implement the requirements of KRS 199.8943 for state-funded preschool program sites to participate in Kentucky's quality-based graduated early childhood rating system. He indicated that the regulation replaces a voluntary four-star system with a mandatory five-star system and the regulation seeks to address the following:

- *Section 1 defines terms used in the administrative regulation;*
- *Section 2 requires state-funded preschool sites to achieve at least a level three rating in Kentucky All STARS;*
- *Section 3 requires KDE to use criteria developed in consultation with Cabinet for Health and Family Services (CHFS) and the Governor's Office of Early Childhood (GOEC) for determining a preschool site's quality rating level;*

- *Section 4 requires preschool sites to verify performance annually with KDE to ensure STARS quality is maintained during the three year certification period;*
- *Section 5 outlines the Kentucky All STARS renewal process for a preschool site;*
- *Section 6 identifies potential conditions requiring a re-evaluation of a preschool site's certification;*
- *Section 7 provides the actions KDE may take if a program site does not meet regulatory requirements for the state-funded preschool program;*
- *Section 8 outlines the appeal process for preschool sites when KDE revokes or takes other action against a site's STAR certification; and*
- *Section 9 incorporates by reference the Kentucky All STARS Rating System.*

Nawanna Privett asked for additional clarity about the Section 7 provisions and what specifically can occur if a site does not meet the regulatory requirements. Buchanan explained that if a site doesn't meet the requirements, then there are steps identified to address the concerns and star ratings ultimately can be revoked if the issues are not remedied.

Buchanan cited that the regulation had been reviewed by the Local Superintendents Advisory Council (LSAC) and was reported favorably, with some positive suggestions for edits to explore prior to the second reading. He said comments also had been received from the Cabinet for Health and Family Services. Buchanan said all other early childhood partners had been briefed on the draft regulation and continued meetings will occur through the month of March. For context, Buchanan and Shepherd provided the committee with an overview of what the current star ratings look like across Kentucky for state-funded preschools and those blended with Head Start programs.

As a first reading, no action was required on this regulation. It will come before the committee for a second reading and final approval at the April KBE meeting.

Chair Houchens entertained a motion for adjournment. The motion to adjourn from the committee meeting was made by Nawanna Privett and seconded by Alesa Johnson. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote and the curriculum committee meeting was adjourned at approximately 1:45 p.m.

XVII.B. Management Committee - State Board Room (514)

Committee Chair Ben Cundiff called the meeting to order at approximately 1:17 p.m. Members present were Bill Twyman, Rich Gimmel and Milton Seymore. Grayson Boyd was absent. Advisor Joe Papalia also joined the committee meeting.

XVII.B.1. Action/Discussion Item

XVII.B.1.a. 2018-2024 KETS Master Plan (701 KAR 5:110, Use of local monies to reduce unmet technology need - Second Reading) - David Couch, KDE Associate Commissioner

KDE Associate Commissioner David Couch presented the 2018-24 Kentucky Education Technology System (KETS) Master Plan for a second reading, which is incorporated by reference into 701 KAR 5:110, Use of local monies to reduce unmet technology need. At the table with him was Marty Park, KDE Chief Digital Officer. Couch highlighted the strengths of Kentucky's plan,

opportunities for continued improvement and the state's education technology priorities for the next six years. No questions were posed by the committee members.

Bill Twyman moved to approve the regulation as presented. Milton Seymore seconded the motion and it passed unanimously on voice vote.

XVII.B.2. Review Item

XVII.B.2.a. Status Update on State Management in Breathitt and Menifee Counties - Kelly Foster and Robin Kinney, KDE Associate Commissioners

KDE Associate Commissioners Kelly Foster and Robin Kinney presented a status update on the school districts current under state management. Foster explained that the inclement weather had caused both districts to miss a significant number of school days.

Beginning with Breathitt County, Foster said the district is working to consolidate multiple schools into a 7-12 building, which will begin operating in the 2018-19 academic year. Foster said this will create substantial cost savings for the district and provide opportunities and resources to students that are not currently available to all. She clarified that the 7th- and 8th-graders still will be isolated in a separate wing of the building.

Foster said Breathitt County is undergoing a management audit, with some of the poor weather preventing the audit from being completed as soon as previously anticipated. Mary Gwen Wheeler asked what triggered the audit and Foster clarified that the audit was mandated by statute for all state-managed districts every three years.

Bill Twyman asked about the district's bonding capacity, which Kinney noted was approximately \$7.3 million. Twyman asked if this was adequate, considering their facility needs. Kinney indicated that it was not adequate. Kinney said the same is true for Menifee County, as well. Foster said both districts are doing much better with finding new efficiencies, which is allowing for larger contingencies, but the needs still far surpass the local capacity in both districts.

Twyman also asked about the teaching and learning environments that were evident in both districts. Foster explained that both districts have education recovery staff in all school buildings. She said this has allowed for a very intentional focus on instruction and assessment. Foster said there is also a district-level education recovery specialist within each district who is coordinating efforts among all schools and ensuring consistency.

As for Menifee County, Foster stated that the district has two new principals and these changes have proven to be very positive. Foster said the district is eligible for its next management audit in July; however, KDE staff likely will wait until September to begin this process, once the school year is back in full swing.

Twyman inquired about the financial status of the district and Kinney noted that there is a shrinking enrollment, which is contributing to lower revenues. Kinney said that the district's bonding capacity is \$3.6 million and they have built up a decent contingency, despite the challenges they are

facing. Foster noted that the district has experienced a difficult time retaining teachers and the district is looking at using some of the its cost savings to provide salary increases for staff.

No additional questions were noted by the committee members regarding the state-managed districts.

Chair Ben Cundiff entertained a motion to adjourn the management committee meeting. Milton Seymore so moved and Twyman seconded the motion, which was unanimously approved by voice vote. The committee meeting adjourned at 1:55 p.m. ET.

XVIII. Report of the Curriculum, Instruction and Assessment Committee

On behalf of the Curriculum, Instruction and Assessment Committee, Committee Chair Houchens moved for approval of the waiver request from Adair County High School for an alternative model of school-based decision making (SBDM) council. Coming from a committee, the motion did not require a second. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

XIX. Report of the Management Committee

On behalf of the Management Committee, Committee Chair Cundiff moved for approval of the 2018-24 KETS Master Plan. Coming from a committee, the motion did not require a second. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

XX. Overview of Kentucky's Minimum High School Graduation Requirements (Review Item: 30 minutes) - KDE Associate Commissioners Amanda Ellis and Laura Arnold

Chair Wheeler set the stage for the next discussion pertaining to the minimum high school graduation requirements. She indicated that this topic would be discussed over the next several KBE meetings and said Commissioner Pruitt will be conducting his annual town hall meetings in the spring to discuss the topic of minimum high school graduation requirements with the public.

Using a PowerPoint presentation that is found on the board's online materials site, KDE Associate Commissioners Amanda Ellis and Laura Arnold outlined Kentucky's current requirements and provided an overview of the former revisions to the administrative regulation governing minimum high school graduation requirements.

Arnold outlined the purpose of the requirements, which are to:

- *align standards and assessments with knowledge and skills required beyond high school;*
- *require all high school students to take challenging courses that prepare them for life after high school;*
- *build college and career ready measures into the statewide accountability system; and*
- *hold schools accountable for graduating students who are college and career ready.*

Ellis explained the state's early graduation policy (2013) and said that its intention has always been to allow accelerated students to move on when ready; however Ellis noted that many barriers still

exist that prohibit this from happening on a large scale. She said new ESSA provisions allow for greater flexibility, which makes the changes to these requirements very timely.

Arnold explained that the role of KBE is to promulgate regulations relating to the courses of study for the minimum requirements for high school graduation, which entitles a student to a high school diploma.

Ellis explained the state's current minimum graduation requirements that are established in administrative regulation 704 KAR 3:305. She informed the board that each student shall have a total of at least 22 credits in high school:

- *4 credits of English (I, II, III, IV). Language arts shall be taken each year of high school. If students are not meeting benchmarks, they must have remediation.*
- *3 credits of math (Algebra I, Geometry, Algebra II). A mathematics course or its equivalent as determined by the district shall be taken each year of high school.*
- *3 credits of social studies as long as all standards are covered.*
- *3 credits of science that shall incorporate lab-based scientific investigation experiences.*
- *½ credit of health.*
- *½ credit of physical education.*
- *1 credit of history and appreciation of visual and performing arts or another arts course that incorporates the content.*
- *7 credits – including 4 standards-based learning experiences in an academic or career interest based on the student's Individual Learning Plan (ILP).*

Ellis stated that students also must demonstrate performance-based competency in technology.

Commissioner Pruitt said any revisions to these requirements will require a different way of thinking about both instruction and assessment. He warned that the state can't revert to a lower level of rigor. He said high school counselors will be critical in communicating about these new expectations.

Gary Houchens said if the state can truly rethink the concept of on-demand assessment, then students could take mastery exams at any time and assessments would not need to be tied to a specific course.

Arnold spent time reviewing the ILP and the state's policies surrounding its use. Arnold explained that the current policy requires schools to implement an advising and guidance process throughout the middle and high schools and develop a method to evaluate the effectiveness and results of the ILP process. Arnold said feeder middle schools and high schools are required to work cooperatively to ensure each student and parent receives information about the tool and advising.

Arnold said schools must review, maintain and make readily available each student's ILP to the student and parent. She indicated that, beginning with a student's 8th-grade year, the ILP shall set learning goals for the student based on academic and career interests and shall identify required academic courses, electives and extracurricular opportunities aligned to the student's postsecondary goals.

Ellis told the board there is much work to do in terms of real, authentic advising and mentoring, which she noted is time intensive. She said that currently, the ILP is seen more as a compliance tool by the field. Ellis said the regulation is well-written, but the execution has been poor since its inception. Ellis noted that, moving forward, KDE can do a much stronger job of promoting this tool and its resources. Arnold said all educators must embrace the responsibility of mentoring and advising, noting that this responsibility can't and shouldn't fall solely on the shoulders of school counselors. She also noted the importance of schools collaborating with business and industry to provide strong systems of career advising.

Ellis went on to outline the provisions for the alternative high school diploma for students with a significant disability. She also stated that 501 students have graduated early to-date and another 468 who are currently enrolled have indicated their intent to graduate early. Rich Gimmel asked whether the state verifies proof of proficiency for students who graduate early. Ellis said they do have to take end-of-course exams and meet college-readiness benchmarks.

Board advisor Wayne Lewis said although the minimum requirements provide much flexibility for local schools and districts, the requirements do not define what a diploma represents and what it means. He noted the importance of balancing the complexity of doing this work in a systemic way, while acknowledging the urgency to create change quickly.

Ellis informed the board of the next steps related to this work, which includes a convening of shareholders to define the state's "graduate profile," which signals what a graduate should know and be able to do. She said that currently, there is a major disconnect between what is required and alignment to the ultimate vision.

Lewis went on to say there is nothing in Kentucky's current system of graduation requirements that stops a child who can't read from getting a high school diploma. Chair Wheeler said the state's standards do address such expectations; however, the question now is whether competency or mastery of those standards needs to be proven prior to high school graduation. Commissioner Pruitt said his vision for modularized assessments can validate this concern.

Milton Seymore asked about the state's timeline for revisions, asking when the state will put a stop to students graduating who are not ready. Pruitt said the target is for any changes to be put in place for the freshmen class entering in fall of 2019.

Chair Wheeler informed the board that the Education Commission of the States will present an overview of graduation requirements across the country at the April KBE meeting.

XXI. Amendments to 703 KAR 5:270 (Kentucky's Accountability System) to Comply with United States Department of Education Review of Kentucky's Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) Consolidated State Plan (Action/Discussion Item: 90 minutes) - Rhonda Sims, KDE Associate Commissioner

KDE Associate Commissioner Rhonda Sims explained that KDE has been in a feedback process with the U.S. Department of Education (USED) over the past several weeks. She said some elements of the feedback have been simple requests for additional information, while others have required changes to the administrative regulation guiding the new assessment and accountability system that the board previously approved. She described and explained that the changes were organized into six big categories:

1. Move writing from the Proficiency Indicator to Separate Academic Indicator

Sims explained that current state law prohibits Kentucky from testing writing every year. According to Sims, USED said the state cannot include writing as a proficiency indicator if the subject is not tested every year.

2. Remove “Whole Child Supports” Category from Opportunity and Access

Sims said USED requires consistent measures across all schools and they would not permit local districts to choose from a menu of supports, as had been previously proposed. As a result, Sims explained that KDE made the decision to eliminate the “whole child supports” category from the accountability system altogether, since budget issues could create inequality in some districts if the state dictated which measures would be included. Commissioner Pruitt said KDE still plans to report these measures, but they will not be formally rated in the system. Chair Wheeler agreed that the measures should still be reported and valued, stating her disappointment that USED will not allow for this innovative approach.

3. Remove Locally-Determined Measure from Opportunity and Access

Sims reiterated that USED requires consistent measures across all schools. Because of this, KDE is proposing to eliminate the locally-determined measure from accountability. She said one district superintendent who is a member of the Local Superintendents Advisory Committee (LSAC) voiced this change as a lost opportunity to incentivize districts to concentrate on unique local needs and opportunities for improvement.

4. Broaden the weights in high school for the Proficiency, Graduation Rate and Transition Readiness Indicators

Sims said KDE is required to widen the range of weights in order to demonstrate to USED that the Academic Indicator (reading/math proficiency and graduation rate) comprise at least 51% of the overall rating. While standard-setting is still yet to be done, Sims said, the ranges proposed will provide for flexibility through the process while also meeting the

USED requirement. Following much debate and discussion, the board ultimately agreed to the following weights for each indicator of the system:

	Proficiency (Reading and Writing and Mathematics)	Separate Academic Indicator (Science, and Social Studies, and Writing)	Growth (including English Language Learners)	Achievement Gap Closure	Opportunity & Access	Transition Readiness (Composite at grades 5 & 8) (High school includes English language learners)	Graduation Rate (4- and 5-year cohort)
Elementary/ Middle Schools	15-25	15-25	20-30	15-25	10-20	5-10	---
High Schools	10-40 [10-20]	10-20	---	10-25 [45-25]	10-20	15-30 [20-30]	5-15
Districts	10-20	10-20	10-20	10-20	10-20	10-20	5-15

5. Emphasize all components of the 5-star system are used to identify low-performing schools

Sims said clarifications to the plan were required to indicate that the full system of indicators would be used in the fall of 2018 to identify all schools, including those classified as Comprehensive Support and Improvement (CSI) and Targeted Support and Improvement (TSI). Sims explained that the CSI and TSI schools are formerly known as the state’s “priority” and “focus” schools.

6. Clarify the English Language Learner (ELL) calculation

Sims said additional detail was necessary surrounding how the (ELL) progress would be calculated and reported. As a result, she said the growth value table within the regulation required amendments for the ELL population.

After providing the overview of the changes, Sims asked if there were particular amendments that any board members or advisors had questions about or wished to discuss further. None were noted by board members or advisors. In terms of next steps, Sims explained that, once approved, the regulation amendments will move forward as agency amendments as the regulation is heard by legislative committees.

Commissioner Pruitt discussed some concerns from the field, particularly JROTC programs, regarding the removal of military readiness as a measure of “transition readiness” within the system. He explained that the removal came as a result of multiple military personnel indicating

that the JROTC program is not a military preparation program, but rather a community leadership program.

Chair Wheeler called for a motion to approve the amendments to 703 KAR 5:270. Ben Cundiff moved to approve the regulation as amended and Milton Seymore seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously by voice vote.

XXII. Board Member Sharing

Board Member Gary Houchens asked for an update from Commissioner Pruitt on the state's standards revisions work, as mentioned in his written report. Commissioner Pruitt said the committees began meeting one week ago and they are spending time asking important questions, such as what the state should want students to know from the standards and how such knowledge will manifest itself for students. He said the committee will soon be reviewing the public feedback received on the standards and also look at standards and frameworks within other states. Alesa Johnson inquired as to how much postsecondary faculty have been involved in the standards revision process, particularly at the high school level. Commissioner Pruitt indicated that there are postsecondary representatives involved at every level on each committee.

Board advisor Joe Papalia asked what other school districts are trending toward potential state management, citing a growing number of districts who are in financial distress. Commissioner Pruitt explained that state management by KDE is only implemented in extreme cases of local management issues. In these instances, he said that KDE has to determine whether the concerns are a revenue issue or an efficiency and management issue. Commissioner Pruitt explained that KDE monitors the financial status of all districts and works with those that are encountering financial hardship. He stressed that state management does not create change if revenue is the issue. He said that, where management concerns are apparent, KDE staff will intervene and conduct a full-blown management audit of the district.

Bill Twyman asked if the board could continue with the "Spotlight on Innovation" presentations seen at previous meetings and the sharing of good news happening within local districts.

XXIII. Internal Board Business

Chair Wheeler informed the board that she had appointed three members to serve on the Spring Awards Committee, which were Alesa Johnson (chair), Bill Twyman and Ben Cundiff. She indicated that all members had accepted their appointment to the committee and she called for a motion, second and vote to formally approve the appointments. A motion for approval was made by Nawanna Privett and seconded by Gary Houchens. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote. Chair Wheeler announced that the awards committee would meet immediately upon adjournment of the day's regular meeting in KDE conference room 516.

XXIV. Adjournment

A motion for adjournment was made by Ben Cundiff and seconded by Gary Houchens. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote and the meeting was adjourned at 3:56 p.m. ET.

XXV. KBE Spring Awards Committee - To Convene Upon Adjournment of Full Board Meeting

Committee Chair Alesa Johnson called the meeting to order at 4:02 p.m. Rebecca Blessing called the roll of members. All committee members were present.

Chair Johnson stated that the purpose of the committee meeting was to review the applications that had been submitted for the Dr. Johnnie Grissom and Dr. Sam Robinson awards and then select the individuals to receive the awards at the April KBE meeting.

Beginning with the Dr. Johnnie Grissom award, Chair Johnson explained that the winner of the award is to be a person or organization who has exhibited leadership, commitment and service to promoting high student achievement and closing the gap for all Kentucky children at the school, community and/or state levels. She asked the committee members to discuss their top two to three applications from the seven total applicants.

Following discussion on each application, Ben Cundiff moved to present this year's award to application #2/3. The same individual was nominated twice for the same award; thus, having two applications. Twyman seconded the motion. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote. The committee agreed that #7 would serve as runner-up, in the event that #2/3 could not serve.

Johnson then explained the Dr. Sam Robinson Award criteria. She indicated that the winner of the award is to be a person or organization who has exhibited leadership, commitment and service to equity and opportunity in education for all Kentucky children at the school, community and/or state levels.

Chair Johnson asked the committee members to discuss their top choices for the award based upon the applications submitted. Following discussion, Cundiff moved to accept application #2 as this year's award winner. Twyman seconded the motion and it carried by unanimous voice vote.

A motion for adjournment was made by Cundiff and seconded by Twyman. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote and the committee meeting adjourned at approximately 4:25 p.m. ET.